

Fundamental classes in motivic homotopy theory

Viktor Tabakov

22.12.2020

Setting

Let S be a qcqs scheme. $\mathcal{SH}(S)$ is the stable ∞ -category of motivic spectra. $\mathcal{SH}(S)$ is symmetric monoidal, denote the monoidal product and the monoidal unit by \otimes and \mathbb{S}_S .

For any morphism of schemes $f: T \rightarrow S$ we get adjoint functors:

$$f^*: \mathcal{SH}(S) \rightarrow \mathcal{SH}(T), \quad f_*: \mathcal{SH}(T) \rightarrow \mathcal{SH}(S),$$

If f is an s-morphism (separated morphism of finite type), we also get an another pair of adjoint functors:

$$f_!: \mathcal{SH}(T) \rightarrow \mathcal{SH}(S), \quad f^!: \mathcal{SH}(S) \rightarrow \mathcal{SH}(T).$$

Six functors 1

$\mathcal{SH}(S)$ is equipped with the six functors formalism. Denote these functors as $(\otimes, \underline{\mathrm{Hom}}, f^*, f_*, f^!, f_!)$. They satisfy a variety of compatibilities. The most useful ones:

- 1 For every morphism f , the functor f^* is symmetric monoidal.
- 2 There is a natural transformation $f_! \rightarrow f_*$ which is invertible when f is proper.
- 3 There is an invertible natural transformation $f^* \rightarrow f^!$ when f is an open immersion.
- 4 There is a canonical isomorphism

$$\mathbb{E} \otimes f_!(\mathbb{F}) \rightarrow f_!(f^*(\mathbb{E}) \otimes \mathbb{F})$$

for any s -morphism $f: T \rightarrow S$ and any $\mathbb{E} \in \mathcal{SH}(S)$,
 $\mathbb{F} \in \mathcal{SH}(T)$.

Six functors 2

5 For any cartesian square

$$\begin{array}{ccc} T' & \xrightarrow{g} & S' \\ \downarrow q & & \downarrow p \\ T & \xrightarrow{f} & S \end{array}$$

where f and g are s-morphisms, there are canonical isomorphisms

$$p^* f_! \rightarrow g_! q^*, \quad q_* g^! \rightarrow f^! p_*.$$

Proposition

Let $f: X \rightarrow S$ be an s-morphism, $\mathbb{E}, \mathbb{F} \in \mathcal{SH}(S)$. Then there is a canonical morphism

$$Ex_{\otimes}^{!*}: f^!(\mathbb{E}) \otimes f^*(\mathbb{F}) \rightarrow f^!(\mathbb{E} \otimes \mathbb{F}).$$



Suspension functor

Definition

If \mathcal{E} is a vector bundle of finite rank over S , define the equivalence $\Sigma^{\mathcal{E}} : \mathcal{SH}(S) \rightarrow \mathcal{SH}(S)$ as a smash product with the Thom space of \mathcal{E} . Denote the inverse as $\Sigma^{-\mathcal{E}}$.

Remark

The suspension functor is compatible with the six functors in the following way:

$$\begin{aligned} f^* \Sigma^{\mathcal{E}} &\cong \Sigma^{f^*(\mathcal{E})} f^*, & f_* \Sigma^{f^*(\mathcal{E})} &\cong \Sigma^{\mathcal{E}} f_*, \\ f^! \Sigma^{\mathcal{E}} &\cong \Sigma^{f^*(\mathcal{E})} f^!, & f_! \Sigma^{f^*(\mathcal{E})} &\cong \Sigma^{\mathcal{E}} f_!. \end{aligned}$$

Purity

- If f is a smooth s -morphism and T_f is its relative tangent bundle, by Ayoub's purity theorem there is a canonical isomorphism of functors $\mathfrak{p}_f: \Sigma^{T_f} f^* \rightarrow f^!$.
- For any cartesian square

$$\begin{array}{ccc} T' & \xrightarrow{g} & S' \\ \downarrow q & & \downarrow p \\ T & \xrightarrow{f} & S \end{array}$$

there is a natural transformation $Ex^{*!}: q^* f^! \rightarrow g^! p^*$. If p or f is smooth, $Ex^{*!}$ is invertible.

Bivariant theories 1

- Bivariant theory. For any s-morphism $p: X \rightarrow S$ and any K-theory class $v \in K(X)$, define the v -twisted bivariant spectrum of X over S as the mapping spectrum

$$\mathbb{E}(X/S, v) = \mathrm{Maps}_{\mathcal{SH}(S)}(\mathbb{S}_S, p_*(p^!(\mathbb{E}) \otimes \mathrm{Th}_X(-v))).$$

We also write $\mathbb{E}_n(X/S, v) = [\mathbb{S}_S[n], p_*(p^!(\mathbb{E}) \otimes \mathrm{Th}_X(-v))]$ for each $n \in \mathbb{Z}$.

Bivariant theories 2

- Cohomology theory. For any morphism $p: X \rightarrow S$, define the v -twisted cohomology spectrum of X over S as the mapping spectrum

$$\mathbb{E}(X, v) = \mathrm{Maps}_{\mathcal{SH}(S)}(\mathbb{S}_S, p_*(p^*(\mathbb{E}) \otimes \mathrm{Th}_X(v))).$$

- Bivariant theory with proper support. For any s -morphism $p: X \rightarrow S$, define the v -twisted bivariant theory with proper support of X over S as the mapping spectrum

$$\mathbb{E}^c(X/S, v) = \mathrm{Maps}_{\mathcal{SH}(S)}(\mathbb{S}_S, p_!(p^!(\mathbb{E}) \otimes \mathrm{Th}_X(-v))).$$

- Cohomology with proper support. For any s -morphism $p: X \rightarrow S$, define the v -twisted cohomology with proper support of X over S as the mapping spectrum

$$\mathbb{E}_c(X/S, v) = \mathrm{Maps}_{\mathcal{SH}(S)}(\mathbb{S}_S, p_!(p^*(\mathbb{E}) \otimes \mathrm{Th}_X(v))).$$

Properties 1

- 1 Base change. For any cartesian square

$$\begin{array}{ccc} X_T & \xrightarrow{g} & X \\ \downarrow q & & \downarrow p \\ T & \xrightarrow{f} & S \end{array}$$

there is a canonical base change map

$$\Delta: \mathbb{E}(X/S, \nu) \rightarrow \mathbb{E}(X_T/T, g^* \nu).$$

- 2 Proper covariance. For any proper morphism $f: X \rightarrow Y$ of s -schemes over S , there is a direct image map

$$f_*: \mathbb{E}(X/S, f^* \nu) \rightarrow \mathbb{E}(Y/S, \nu).$$

Properties 2

- 3 Étale contravariance. For any étale s-morphism $f: X \rightarrow Y$ of s-schemes over S , there is an inverse image map

$$f^!: \mathbb{E}(Y/S, \nu) \rightarrow \mathbb{E}(X/S, f^* \nu).$$

- 4 Product. If \mathbb{E} is equipped with a multiplication map $\mu_{\mathbb{E}}: \mathbb{E} \otimes \mathbb{E} \rightarrow \mathbb{E}$, then for s-morphisms $p: X \rightarrow S$ and $q: Y \rightarrow X$ and $\nu \in K(X)$, $w \in K(Y)$, there is a map

$$\mathbb{E}(Y/X, w) \otimes \mathbb{E}(X/S, \nu) \rightarrow \mathbb{E}(Y/S, w + q^* \nu).$$

Localization triangle

Let $i: Z \rightarrow S$ be a closed immersion. The direct image functor $i_*: \mathcal{SH}(Z) \rightarrow \mathcal{SH}(S)$ is fully faithful. If the complementary closed immersion $j: U \rightarrow S$ is quasi-compact, by the Morel-Voevodsky localization theorem there is an exact triangle

$$i_* i^! \rightarrow \mathrm{Id} \rightarrow j_* j^*.$$

Proposition

Let $i: Z \rightarrow X$ be a closed immersion of \mathbb{A}^1 -schemes over S , with a quasi-compact complementary open immersion $j: U \rightarrow X$. Then for any $e \in K(X)$ there exists a canonical exact triangle of spectra

$$\mathbb{E}(Z/S, e) \xrightarrow{i_*} \mathbb{E}(X/S, e) \xrightarrow{j^*} \mathbb{E}(U/S, e),$$

which is called the localization triangle.



Orientation

For any s -morphism $f: X \rightarrow S$ and any $v \in K(X)$ set $H(X/S, v) = \mathbb{S}_S(X/S, v)$.

Definition

An orientation of f is a pair (η_f, e_f) , where $e_f \in K(X)$ and $\eta_f \in H(X/S, e_f)$. We also write η_f instead of (η_f, e_f) .

Definition

If for any $v \in K(X)$, cap-product with η_f induces an isomorphism

$$\gamma_{\eta_f}: H(X, v) \rightarrow H(X/S, e_f - v), \quad x \mapsto x \cdot \eta_f,$$

then we call γ_{η_f} the duality isomorphism.

Fundamental class

Let f be a smooth s -morphism with tangent bundle T_f .

Definition

The purity isomorphism $p_f: \Sigma^{T_f} f^* \rightarrow f^!$ induces a canonical isomorphism

$$\eta_f: \mathrm{Th}_X(T_f) \xrightarrow{\sim} f^!(\mathbb{S}_S).$$

The fundamental class of f is the orientation $\eta_f \in H(X/S, \langle T_f \rangle)$.

System of fundamental classes 1

Let S be a scheme and let \mathcal{C} be a class of morphisms between s -schemes over S . A system of fundamental classes for \mathcal{C} consists of the following data:

- 1 Fundamental classes. For each morphism $f: X \rightarrow Y$ in \mathcal{C} , there is an orientation $(\eta_f^{\mathcal{C}}, e_f)$.
- 2 Normalization. For each scheme S , with the identity morphism $f = id_S$, there are identifications $e_f \cong 0$ in $K(S)$ and $\eta_f^{\mathcal{C}} \cong 1$ in $H(S/S, 0)$.
- 3 Associativity formula. Let $f: X \rightarrow Y$ and $g: Y \rightarrow Z$ be morphisms in \mathcal{C} such that the composite $g \circ f$ is also in \mathcal{C} . Then there are identifications $e_{g \circ f} \cong e_f + f^*(e_g)$ in $K(X)$ and $\eta_g^{\mathcal{C}} \cdot \eta_f^{\mathcal{C}} \cong \eta_{g \circ f}^{\mathcal{C}}$ in $H(X/Z, e_{g \circ f})$.

System of fundamental classes 2

We say that a system of fundamental classes $(\eta_f^{\mathcal{C}})_f$ is stable under transverse base change if it is equipped with the following data:

- 4 Transverse base change formula. For any tor-independent cartesian square

$$\begin{array}{ccc} Y & \xrightarrow{g} & T \\ \downarrow q & & \downarrow p \\ X & \xrightarrow{f} & S \end{array}$$

such that f and g are in \mathcal{C} , there are identifications $e_g \cong q^*(e_f)$ in $K(Y)$ and $\Delta^*(\eta_f^{\mathcal{C}}) \cong \eta_g^{\mathcal{C}}$.

Main theorem for smooth morphisms

Example

Let S be a scheme. Then there exists a system of fundamental classes $(\eta_f, \langle T_f \rangle)$ on the class of smooth morphisms between s -schemes over S , satisfying the following properties:

- For every smooth morphism $f: X \rightarrow Y$, the orientation $\eta_f \in H(X/Y, \langle T_f \rangle)$ is the fundamental class defined earlier.
- The system is stable under transverse base change.

Virtual tangent bundle

If f is a smoothable lci, then f factors as $f = p \circ i$, where i is a regular closed immersion and p is smooth. The virtual tangent bundle $\langle L_f \rangle$ of f is $i^* \langle T_p \rangle - \langle N_i \rangle$, where T_p is the class of relative tangent bundle of p and N_i is the class of the normal bundle of i . $\langle L_f \rangle$ does not depend from the choice of p and i .

If we have two smoothable lci morphisms $f: X \rightarrow Y$ and $g: Y \rightarrow Z$, then $\langle L_{g \circ f} \rangle$ can be identified with $\langle L_f \rangle + f^* \langle L_g \rangle$.

Gysin maps

Let $f: X \rightarrow Y$ be a morphism of s -schemes over S , $e \in K(Y)$. Any orientation $\eta_f \in H(X/Y, e_f)$ gives rise to a Gysin map

$$\eta_f^!: H(Y/S, e) \rightarrow H(X/S, f^*(e) + e_f), \quad x \mapsto \eta_f x$$

using the product in bivariant \mathbb{A}^1 -theory. We also write $f^!$ instead of $\eta_f^!$.

Purity transformation 1

Definition

Let $f: X \rightarrow S$ be an s-morphism and (η_f, e_f) be its orientation. The class $\eta_f \in H(X/S, e_f)$ can be seen as a morphism in $\mathcal{SH}(X)$:

$$\eta_f: \mathrm{Th}(e_f) \rightarrow f^!(\mathbb{S}_S).$$

It gives rise to a natural transformation

$$p(\eta_f): \Sigma^{e_f} f^* \rightarrow f^!$$

defined as

$$f^*(-) \otimes \mathrm{Th}_X(e_f) \xrightarrow{Id \otimes \eta_f} f^*(-) \otimes f^!(\mathbb{S}_S) \xrightarrow{Ex_{\otimes}^{!*}} f^!(- \otimes \mathbb{S}_S) \cong f^!.$$

Purity transformation 2

Remark

When f is smooth, it is the purity isomorphism.

Remark

(η_f, e_f) and $\mathfrak{p}(\eta_f)$ are essentially interchangeable. Evaluating $\mathfrak{p}(\eta_f)$ on \mathbb{S}_S gives η_f .

Thom isomorphism

Let X be an s -scheme over S and $p: E \rightarrow X$ be a vector bundle.

Lemma

The Gysin map $p^!: H(X/S, e) \rightarrow H(E/S, p^*e + p^*\langle E \rangle)$ is invertible.

Definition

Define the Thom isomorphism

$$\phi_{E/X}: H(E/S, e) \rightarrow H(X/S, e - \langle E \rangle)$$

to be the inverse of $p^!: H(X/S, e - \langle E \rangle) \rightarrow H(E/S, e)$.

Euler class

If $\nu: F \rightarrow E$ is a monomorphism of vector bundles over X , one gets a canonical morphism of pointed sheaves $\nu_*: \mathrm{Th}_X(F) \rightarrow \mathrm{Th}_X(E)$.

Definition

Let E be a vector bundle over X and s be its zero section. Define the Euler class $e(E)$ of E/X as the induced map in $\mathcal{H}_\bullet(X)$:

$$s_*: \mathrm{Th}_X(X) \rightarrow \mathrm{Th}_X(E).$$

We will often view the Euler class as a class $e(E) \in H(Y, \langle E \rangle) \cong H(Y/Y, -\langle E \rangle)$, via the canonical map

$$\mathrm{Maps}_{\mathcal{H}_\bullet(X)}(X_+, \mathrm{Th}_X(E)) \rightarrow \mathrm{Maps}_{\mathcal{SH}(X)}(\mathbb{S}_X, \mathrm{Th}_X(E)).$$

For any scheme X and any $e \in K(X)$ one has the following diagrams:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} \mathbb{G}_m X & \xrightarrow{j} & \mathbb{A}^1 X \\ & \searrow \pi & \swarrow \bar{\pi} \\ & X & \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{ccccc} H(X, 1 - e) & \xlongequal{\quad} & H(X/X, e - 1) & \xrightarrow{\bar{\pi}^!} & H(\mathbb{A}^1 X/X, e) \\ \downarrow \pi^* & & \downarrow \pi^! & & \downarrow j^! \\ H(\mathbb{G}_m X, 1 - e) & \xrightarrow{\gamma_{\eta\pi}} & H(\mathbb{G}_m X/X, e) & \xlongequal{\quad} & H(\mathbb{G}_m X/X, e) \end{array}$$

where $\langle T_\pi \rangle \cong 1$ in $K(\mathbb{G}_m X)$, $\langle T_{\bar{\pi}} \rangle \cong 1$ in $K(\mathbb{A}^1 X)$.

Consider the localization triangle associated to the zero section $s_0: X \rightarrow \mathbb{A}_X^1$:

$$H(\mathbb{A}^1 X/X, e)[-1] \xrightarrow{j^!} H(\mathbb{G}_m X/X, e)[-1] \xrightarrow{\partial_{s_0}} H(X/X, e).$$

It splits canonically and we get a section of ∂_{s_0} :

$$\gamma_t: H(X/X, e) \rightarrow H(\mathbb{G}_m X/X, e)[-1].$$

Let X be an S -scheme, $i: Z \rightarrow X$ a regular closed immersion, $e \in K(X)$. Define $D_Z X$ to be the deformation space $B_{Z \times 0}(X \times \mathbb{A}^1) \setminus B_{Z \times 0}(X \times 0)$, where $B_Z X$ is a blow-up of X in Z . One also has

$$N_Z X \xrightarrow{k} D_Z X \xleftarrow{h} \mathbb{G}_m X,$$

where h and k are an open and a closed immersion. Consider the associated localization triangle:

$$\begin{aligned} H(N_Z X/S, e) &\xrightarrow{k_*} H(D_Z X/S, e) \xrightarrow{h^!} H(\mathbb{G}_m X/S, e) \xrightarrow{\partial_{N_Z X/D_Z X}} \\ &\xrightarrow{\partial_{N_Z X/D_Z X}} H(N_Z X/S, e)[-1] \end{aligned}$$

Fundamental class for regular closed immersion

The fundamental class $\eta_i \in H(Z/X, -\langle N_Z X \rangle)$ associated to the regular closed immersion $i: Z \rightarrow X$ is the image of $1 \in H(X/X, 0)$ by the composite

$$\begin{aligned} H(X/X, 0) &\xrightarrow{\gamma_t} H(\mathbb{G}_m X/X, 0)[-1] \xrightarrow{\partial_{N_Z X/D_Z X}} \\ &\xrightarrow{\partial_{N_Z X/D_Z X}} H(N_Z X/X, 0) \xrightarrow{\phi_{N_Z X/Z}} H(Z/X, -\langle N_Z X \rangle) \end{aligned}$$

where $\phi_{N_Z X/Z}$ is the Thom isomorphism of $p: N_Z X \rightarrow Z$.

Main theorem for regular closed immersions

Theorem

Let S be a scheme. Then there exists a system of fundamental classes $(\eta_i, -\langle N_i \rangle)$ on the class of regular closed immersions between s -schemes over S , satisfying the following properties:

- For every regular closed immersion $i: Z \rightarrow X$, the orientation $\eta_i \in H(Z/X, -\langle N_i \rangle)$ is the fundamental class defined earlier.
- The system is stable under transverse base change.

Main theorem

Theorem

Let S be a scheme. Then there exists a system of fundamental classes $(\eta_f, \langle L_f \rangle)$ on the class of smoothable lci morphisms between s -schemes over S , satisfying the following properties:

- The restriction of the system $(\eta_f, \langle L_f \rangle)$ to the class of smooth s -morphisms coincides with the previous one.
- The restriction of the system $(\eta_f, \langle L_f \rangle)$ to the class of regular closed immersions coincides with the previous one.
- The system is stable under transverse base change.

Let S be a scheme and $\mathbb{E} \in \mathcal{SH}(S)$. Either using the unit map $\eta: \mathbb{S}_S \rightarrow \mathbb{E}$ or doing all constructions for $\mathbb{E}(X/S, \nu)$ instead of $H(X/S, \nu) = \mathbb{S}_S(X/S, \nu)$, one can define the fundamental classes of f with coefficients in \mathbb{E} :

$$\eta_f^{\mathbb{E}} \in \mathbb{E}(X/S, \langle L_f \rangle).$$

One can also define the Euler class with coefficients in \mathbb{E} :

$$e(E, \mathbb{E}) \in \mathbb{E}(X, \langle E \rangle) \cong \mathbb{E}(X/X, -\langle E \rangle).$$

Example

When \mathbb{E} is oriented, the Euler class coincides with the top Chern class. When \mathbb{E} is the Milnor-Witt spectrum $\widetilde{\mathbf{H}\mathbb{Z}}$, the Euler class is the classical Euler class in the Chow-Witt group.

Let \mathcal{T} be a motivic ∞ -category of coefficients, defined over the site \mathcal{S} of qcqs schemes. All the constructions make sense in the setting of \mathcal{T} , as they use only six functors:

- One can define the four theories. For example, the bivariant theory is

$$\mathbb{E}(X/S, v, \mathcal{T}) := \mathrm{Maps}_{\mathcal{T}(S)}(\mathbb{1}_S, p_*(p^!(\mathbb{E}) \otimes \mathrm{Th}_X(-v, \mathcal{T}))),$$

where $p: X \rightarrow S$ is an s-morphism and $v \in K(X)$.

- We have a system of fundamental classes and purity transformations with coefficients in $\mathbb{E} \in \mathcal{T}(S)$, satisfying stability under transverse base change:

$$\eta_f^{\mathcal{T}} \in \mathbb{E}(X/Y, -\langle L_f \rangle, \mathcal{T}), \quad \mathfrak{p}_f^{\mathcal{T}}: \Sigma^{L_f} f^* \rightarrow f^!$$

for any smoothable lci s-morphism $f: X \rightarrow Y$ of s-schemes over S .

- There are functorial Gysin maps with coefficients in any $\mathbb{E} \in \mathcal{T}(S)$.

Examples

- If we consider the motivic cohomology spectrum $\mathbf{H}\mathbb{Z} \in \mathcal{SH}(S)$, we obtain the bivariant theory with higher Chow groups.
- If we consider the Milnor-Witt motivic cohomology spectrum $\widetilde{\mathbf{H}}\mathbb{Z} \in \mathcal{SH}(S)$, we obtain the bivariant theory with higher Chow-Witt groups.
- If 2 is invertible, we can consider the spectrum of homotopy invariant Hermitian K-theory $\mathbf{BO} \in \mathcal{SH}(S)$. We obtain a bivariant theory with it.

Chern–Gauss–Bonnet theorem

Let M be a compact orientable $2n$ -dimensional Riemannian manifold without boundary and e be the Euler class. Then

$$\chi(M) = \int_M e(TM).$$

Categorical Euler characteristic

Definition

Let \mathcal{C} be a symmetric monoidal category, $A \in \mathcal{C}$ be a strongly dualizable object and $f: A \rightarrow A$ an endomorphism. Then the trace of f is an endomorphism of the unit $\mathbb{1}_{\mathcal{C}}$ given by the composition

$$\mathbb{1}_{\mathcal{C}} \xrightarrow{\text{coev}} A \otimes A^{\vee} \xrightarrow{f \otimes \text{Id}} A \otimes A^{\vee} \cong A^{\vee} \otimes A \xrightarrow{\text{ev}} \mathbb{1}_{\mathcal{C}}.$$

Definition

Let $p: X \rightarrow S$ be a smooth proper morphism. Define the categorical Euler characteristic $\chi^{\text{cat}}(X/S) \in \text{Maps}_{\mathcal{SH}(S)}(\mathbb{S}_S, \mathbb{S}_S)$ as trace of $f = \text{Id}$ and $A = p_! p^!(\mathbb{1}_S)$. We view $\chi^{\text{cat}}(X/S)$ as a class in $H(S/S, 0)$.

The motivic Gauss-Bonnet formula

Theorem

Let $p: X \rightarrow S$ be a smooth proper morphism. There is an identification $\chi^{cat}(X/S) \cong p_*(e(T_p))$ in the group $H(S, 0)$.

Consider the diagonal regular closed immersion $\delta: X \rightarrow X \times_S X$ and the cartesian diagram

$$\begin{array}{ccc} X \times_S X & \xrightarrow{\pi_2} & X \\ \downarrow \pi_1 & & \downarrow p \\ X & \xrightarrow{p} & S \end{array}$$

Lemma

Define $\theta: \delta^! \rightarrow \delta^*$ to be the exchange transformation $Ex^{!*}: Id^* \delta^! \rightarrow Id^! \delta^*$. The endomorphism $\chi^{cat}(X/S): \mathbb{S}_S \rightarrow \mathbb{S}_S$ is obtained by evaluating the following natural transformation of at the monoidal unit \mathbb{S}_S :

$$\begin{array}{ccccccc}
 Id & \xrightarrow{\quad \quad \quad} & Id \\
 \downarrow unit & & \uparrow counit \\
 p_* p^* & \xlongequal{\quad} & p_* \delta^!(\pi_2)^! p^* & \xleftarrow[\simeq]{Ex^*!} & p_* \delta^!(\pi_1)^* p^! & \xrightarrow{\theta} & p_* \delta^*(\pi_1)^* p^! & \xlongequal{\quad} & p_* p^!
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{ccccc}
 p^* = \delta^!(\pi_2)^! p^* & \xleftarrow{E_X^{!*}} & \delta^!(\pi_1)^* p^! & \xrightarrow{\theta} & \delta^*(\pi_1)^* p^! = p^! \\
 & \searrow \Sigma^{-T_p} p_p & \uparrow p_\delta & \nearrow \epsilon_p p^! & \\
 & & \Sigma^{-T_p} p^! & &
 \end{array}$$

Here ϵ_p is the natural transformation $\Sigma^{-T_p} \rightarrow \text{Id}$ induced by the Euler class $e(T_p): \mathbb{S}_X \rightarrow \text{Th}_X(T_p)$.